Please print in ink or type

MAY 1 3 2013

ARKANSAS STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION

BEFORE THE STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION Of the State of Arkansas

RECEIVED

,	
⊠Mr.	Do Not Write in These Spaces
□ Mrs. □ Ms.	Claim No. 13-0804-CC
□ Miss Hayward Patterson, #145893, Claimant	Date Filed May 13, 2013 (Month) (Day) (Yest)
VS.	Amount of Claim \$ 10,000.00
State of Arkansas, Respondent	Fund DOC
Dept. of Correction	
COMPLAINI	Personal Injury, Pain & Sufferin Negligence, Failure to Follow Procedure
Hayward Patterson, #145893 the above named Claimant, of 300 Cor	rections Dr. Newport, AR 72112 (Street or R.F.D. & No.)
ARKANSAS 72112 County of JACKSON represent	(Logal Counsel, if any, for Claim)
of 300 Corrections Da, Newport, ARKANSAS (Street and No.) (City) (State) (Zie Code)	72/12 saya:
and Dut Da made	at sought: 10,000 dollars
Month, day, year and place of Incident or service: 11. 29 12 in GRIMES UNIT.	Housing 1 of Boks 1
Explanation: On 11.29.12 Af Approx 5:00 AM. I want over to	the 190 proof Machine an fixed
THE A CUP OF HO+ COFFEE then TCALLED OFFICER DIO	Key to ASK him was I on the
the Aforh that was installed be Kunsel the Broke	n, Between the Bencharea.
Out to FAR. I tripped OVER it and dashed Hot Co	AFEE IN MY FACE AND NECK
And ALSO injudying my Knee, BACK, and my head when	T FELL BR TRIPPING THEIR
So be and innate (Tagon Hudern Virtual medical assist	ence) And I Replied (yes).
DAIN And when office & Dickey returned from Calling	Medical (nurse Dulizer)
Stated : if he as Isn't Bleed in an Swollen then tel	I him to put in A Sick-CAIL
Shift (Dev Shift) After 240 hours (mm my To	nce And Medical the NEXT
ME). An WARDED MADIES And RICK JE FECU (REVIEW	Officer) Susan Townson
Sabotoged my grisvance on the maintenance Creu	1. to Stop my Claim from
DEING PIZE OF TO REPORTED IT TO RAY HOBBS DIRECTOR	8 Sot Kednedy Refused to
SEVERAL ORGERS Submitted to Repair the Bench. An	After the Incident then
MAINTENANCE REPaired it . Mr. Dotson And COLVAND	EMAN ARE RESPONSIBLE.
000	Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof?
(Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year)	(Department)
and that the following action was taken thereon:	
and that \$ was paid thereon: (2) Has any third person or corporation an interest in the	is claim? <u>NO</u> ; if so, state name and address
(Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) and that the nature thereof is as follows:	(State) (Zip Code)
: and was acquired on	in the following manner:
/V A	
THE UNDERSIGNED states on oath that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forti that they are true.	h in the above complaint, and that he or she verily believes
HAYWARD PAHEISON Haywards	atterson
(Print Claimant/Representative Name)	ignature of Claimant/Representative)
SWORN TO and subscribed before me at	Warport AR
COREY R MCCULLOUGH (MOTERY PUBLIC-STATE OF ARKANSAS on this 5th day of Ag	(City) (State)
IZARD COUNTY My Commission Expires 03-05-2022 Commission # 12386737 (Date)	R. Manufal (Year)
SF1- R7/99	(Notary Public)
My Commission Expires:	/5/2020 (Day) (Yesr)

MAY 1 6 2013

BEFORE THE ARKANSAS STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION

RECEIVED

HAYWARD PATTERSON (ADC 145893)

CLAIMANT

V.

NO. 13-0804-CC

ARKANSAS DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTION

RESPONDENT

ANSWER

COMES NOW the Respondent, Arkansas Department of Correction, and for its Answer, states and alleges as follows:

- 1. Respondent denies liability in this claim and asserts it will hold the Claimant to strict proof on each allegation unless admitted by Respondent. Respondent reserves the right to plead further upon completion of the investigation by internal affairs and requests the matter be held in abeyance until the investigation is complete.
- 2. The applicable account information required by the Commission is:

a. Agency number: 0480

Cost Center: HCA0100

c. Internal Order:

340301

Fund Center: 509 d.

WHEREFORE, for the reasons cited above the Respondent prays that the claim be dismissed with prejudice and that Claimant take nothing, or in the alternative that the matter be held in abeyance until completion of the investigation by internal affairs.

Respectfully submitted,

Department of Correction Office of Counsel

LISA MILLS WILKINS Ark. Bar #87190

Attorney Supervisor Post Office Box 8707 Pine Bluff, AR 71611 (870)267-6844 Office

(870)267-6373 Facsimile

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of this pleading has been served this ______ day of ______ 2013, on the Claimant by placing a copy of the same in the U. S. Mail, regular postage to:

Hayward Patterson (ADC 145893) Grimes Unit 300 Corrections Drive New Port, AR 72112

Mils Till River LS WILKINS Ark. Bar #87190

BEFORE THE ARKANSAS STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION

NO. 13-0804-CC

ARKANSAS DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTION

RESPONDENT

CLAIMANT

RESPONDENT'S MOTION TO DISMISS

COMES NOW the Respondent, Arkansas Department of Correction, and for its MOTION TO DISMISS, states and responds as follows:

- 1. Claimant has filed an action for personal injury, negligence, failure to follow procedure and seeks damages of \$60,000.00.
- 2. Claimant has attached several grievances to his pleading, but did not exhaust his remedies on this issue. He alleges that the grievance was 'sabotaged', but does not state how or by what means. Specifically, he attaches an incomplete grievance referencing a maintenance complaint concerning the bench installation. This grievance is the basis of his Complaint and he did not exhaust it. Under AD 12-16, inmate Grievance Procedure if he did not get a response to the informal grievance within three working days, 'the inmate may proceed to Step 2, the formal grievance, without the completion of Step 1.' Claimant failed to do this and therefore, has failed to exhaust his administrative remedies.
- 3. Furthermore, inmates are allowed fifteen (15) days in which to file a claim. If claimant knew that the Step One had not been returned to him, he could have submitted another within the twelve (12) remaining days. Inmates are allowed to only submit three (3) grievances every seven (7) days. According to AD 12-16 VII(J)(1)b) "Inmates are only allowed to submit three formal grievances, Step Two, each seven-day period which begins each Saturday and ends on Friday. Only the first three formal grievances, Step Two, submitted each week by an inmate requires an investigation and response. This limit includes both institutional and medical or mental health grievances. All other formal grievances will be logged and reviewed to determine if an emergency exists. If it is determined to be an emergency situation, action will be taken promptly to resolve the issue; however, a written response to the inmate is not required. If no emergency exists, the grievance will be logged out on the same day received, and it shall be written on the Unit Level Grievance Form "No action necessary-exceeds weekly limit," dated and signed. The original grievance will then be placed in the grievance file and no written response will be given to the inmate.
- 4. Claimant utilized his three grievances prior to the maintenance grievance being submitted and so it was not addressed according it policy. Claimant did not exhaust this grievance.
- 5. Under Administrative Directive 12-16 (N) which provides that "inmates are hereby advised that they must exhaust their administrative remedies as to all defendants at all levels of the grievance procedure before filing a Section 1983 lawsuit and Claims

CLAIMS COMMISSION

Commission claim. If this is not done, their lawsuit or claims may be dismissed immediately."

- 6. Just as in the Prison Litigation Reform Act (PLRA), 42 U.S.C. § 1997e, which states "No action shall be brought with respect to prison conditions under section 1979 of the Revised Statutes of the United States (42 U.S.C. § 1983), or any other Federal law, by a prisoner confined in any jail, prison, or other correctional facility until such administrative remedies as are available are exhausted," this matter should be dismissed for failing to exhaust.
- 7. The courts have interpreted this provision as a mandatory requirement requires complete exhaustion of administrative remedies prior to filing suit. The Courts have held that the exhaustion requirement applies to "all inmate suits about prison life, whether they involve general circumstances or particular episodes, and whether they allege excessive force or some other wrong." *Porter v. Nussle*, 534 U.S. 516, 532 (2002).
- 8. A.C.A. Section 19-10-204(b)(3) states "The commission shall make no award for any claim which, as a matter of law, would be dismissed from a court of law or equity for reasons other than sovereign immunity." Claimant's claim would be dismissed for failing to exhaust his case were it in federal court on other grounds and it should be dismissed here.
- 9. In his cover letter accompanying this pleading, Claimant argues that the exhaustion requirement is inapplicable because it does not provide a remedy to Claimant. However, federal court also recognizes the requirements of Administrative Directive (AD) 09-01, the Inmate Grievance Procedure, which outlines the process for filing and appealing grievances. In *Johnson v. Jones*, 340 F.3d 624, 627 (8th Cir. 2003), the Court held that "under the plain language of section 1997e(a), an inmate must exhaust administrative remedies *before* filing suit in federal court....If exhaustion was not completed at the time of filing, dismissal is mandatory."
- 10. If the federal courts recognize this preliminary step in the process, the commission has and should continue to recognize it under the theory of rule of law.
- 11. Since Claimant did not exhaust his grievance process his Complaint should be dismissed.

WHEREFORE, for the reasons stated above and the evidence submitted, the Respondent prays that this matter be dismissed.

Respectfully submitted, Department of Correction Office of Counsel

LISA MILLS WILKINS Ark. Bar #87190

Attorney Supervisor Post Office Box 8707 Pine Bluff, AR 71611 (870)267-6844 Office (870)267-6373 Facsimile

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the above pleading has been served this 30 day of May, 2013, on the below Claimant by placing a copy of the same in the U. S. Mail, regular postage to:

HAYWARD PATTERSON (ADC#145893) Grimes Unit 300 Corrections Drive Newport, AR 72112

LISA MILLS WILKINS Ark. Bar #87190

15016822823

rant. H ++	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
	I certify that a copy of Above pleading has been Served this
	Lisa mill's wilkins ARK. BAR #87190 Attorney Supervisor
	P.O. BOX 8707
	Pine Bluff AR 71611
	MR Norman Hodges JR
	Claim Commission
	10/E. Capital Avenue, Suite 410
	Little Rock, AR 72201-3823
	By: Hayward Patterson
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

IN THE PARKANSAS STATE CLAIMS COMMISSIONARKANSAS CIAIMS COMMISS

JUN 26 2013

RECEIVED

PAYWARD PATTERSON V. ARKANSAS DEPT. OF CORRECTION CLAIM NO. 13-0804-CC

CRAIMANT 13 MOTION TO WITHDRAW VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL

COMES NOW THE CLAIMANT HEREIN, NAMELY, HOYWARD POSTERS

(1) That Claimonst 18 being ing this plead-

ING IN Good Porth.

(2) At a 11 fines

RELEVANT AND

MENTIONED to herein, claimant submitted a motion

for voluntary dismissal of this claim and all of

the issues within it. Claimant merely did so

because be thought that he had not exhausted

his administrative remedies as required by

the PRRA-42 U.S.C. 3 1997(e).

(3) The claimant has Realized that he has indeed exhausted his administra-

tive remedies and would now like to withdraw his motion for voluntary dismissal. The follow-

(4) Exhibits NumbER 1 & 2 BRE enst tutional grievance & both dated November 29, 2012, Thursday, where in which claimant went 211 the way to Wendy Kelly, Doputy Director of HEath and Coreschonal Programs, then MARNIN EVONS, DEPUTY DIRECfor Respectively about this Claim - THEN - Exhibit #3, an institutional que vance dated Saturday Qual, 2013, Where olsinamit had attempted to ABBIN EXHAUST, which was REJECTED by the wist tutional griovance officer at level one WITH NOTHING SPECIFICALLY EXPLAINING REASONS WHY IT WAS REJECTED - plus - by Marin Evano, who MERELY 39REEd with the REJECTION, SUCH OCCURRING ON OR 26 out Manday, June 3, 2013 and Monday June 14 2013, RESPECTIVELY.

Then Exhibit #4, a memorandum doted Monday Selvenary 4, 2013, Prom John Maplen, Warden of the Pacility, talked about the Movember 29, 2012 13346.

Again, pense of expansion of the Required admini strative remedes - puesuant to 28 U.S.C. \$ 1915, et seq.

(5) At all times RELEVENT and mention to herein, claimant moves that this Howpeoble Court (Commission not only grant claimant's claim, bacause not only is it clearly. established" that the REspondent are Lieble. 1/ 13 30 sought. Respectfully submitted, 131 Hayward Patherson HAYWARD PATTERSON-Claimant A.D. C. # 145893 GRIMES UNIT 300 Careschors Dr. NEWPORT, AR 72/12-1058

		MMISSION DOCKET	
10,000.00 Amount of Claim \$			13-0804-C0
		Attorneys	
Hayward Patterson, #145893	Claimant	Pro se	
V8.	Claument		Claiman
Department of Correction	Respondent	Lisa Wilkins, Attorney	
State of Arkansas			
May 14, 2013		Type of Claim	
	FINDING C	F FACTS	
The Claims Com Voluntary Dismissal," w denied and dismissed wi	ithout prejudice." T	imously grants the Claimant's " herefore, this claim is hereby ur	Motion for animously
IT IS SO ORDER	RED.		
	(See Back of Op	oinion Form)	
	CONCLL	ISION	
The Claims Comm Voluntary Dismissal," wit denied and dismissed with	thout prejudice." The	mously grants the Claimant's "N erefore, this claim is hereby una	Action for mimously
ste of Hearing June 14, 2013		a	
		Park	
te of Disposition		- Contraction	Chairman

IN THE MATTER OF : HAYWARD PATTERSON # 145893 U. DEPT. OF CORRECTION Quan No. 13-0804-CC

CLAIRANT'S MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION & RE-HEARING

COMES NOW THE CLAIMANT HEREIN, NAMELY, HAYWAYA PETERSONS POR HIS MOTION FOR RECONSTRUCTION & RECONSTRUCTION & RE- HEARING, PRO 30, STATES:

(1) That the alaiment beings this Plead-

My IN good Parth.

(2) ON OR about Thursday, June 19,2013, the Claims Commission unanimously voted to dismiss the Claimant's claim, doing so based upon claimant's motion for voluntary cliemissal, doing so without presupice.

> (b) Pulsuant to Rule 59(2)(2)(6) \$ (7)

A.R. C.v. P., the claimant moves for a reconsideration/RE-hearing, based wow the fact that course! for the respondent had committed froud, froudulent proctices, which forces claimant to file a voluntary dismissal motion.

When the Commission recoude the ERUITABLE RELIEF

It 18 30 304.9ht.

dated: 6/21/13

RESPECTFULLY Submitted

BL Hayward Patterson

HAYWARD PATTERSON-Claiment!

A.D.C. # 195893

BAIMES UNIT

300 CORRECTIONAL DR.

NEWFORT, AR 12112-1058

Footnote ONE:

The OHY. Gen., Lipa Wilking, made claims

Commission think that the Claimant had not "exhausted his administrative remedies" by the Inserance procedure: THIS was unreve. The Ottached documentation shows not ofly ACTUAL 1900F OF EXHAUSTION OF his indiministrative Remedies

STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION SOCKET OPINION

10,000.00 Amount of Claim \$		13-0804-CC Claim No	
Hayward Patterson, #145893	Claimant	Attorneys Pro se Claimant	
Department of Correction		Lisa Wilkins, Attorney	
State of Arkansas May 13, 2013 Date Filed		Personal Injury, Pain & Sufferi Type of Claim — Nogligence & Failure to Follow	

FINDING OF FACTS

The Claims Commission hereby unanimously denies Claimant's "Motion for Reconsideration" for the Claimant's failure to offer evidence that was not previously available. Therefore, the Commission's June 14, 2013, order remains in effect.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

(See Back of Opinion Form)

CONCLUSION

The Claims Commission hereby unanimously denies Claimant's "Motion for Reconsideration" for the Claimant's failure to offer evidence that was not previously available. Therefore, the Commission's June 14, 2013, order remains in effect.

Date of HearingJi	dy 11, 2013	
Date of Disposition	fuly 11, 2013	Patporm Chairman
		Jun Baku Commissioner Commissioner

12

IN THE DEKANSAS STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION Haywood Paffeeson U. State of Ankansas Claim No.: 13-0804CC CLAIMANT'S NOTICE OF APPEAL AND DESIGNATION LOMES NOW THE CLAIMANT HEREIN, NAMELY, HOYOLOOM Patterson, AND FOR 418 PLASE NOTICE OF APPEAL AND DESTENATION, HEREBY STATES:

(1) At all times rele-Some for herein, such is brought forth in good Bith. vant and mentioned (2) fuesuant to ACA 19-10-201 - thru - 210, et sego, the petitioning claimant is hereby ap realing the Enol devial of the Janday, culy 11,2013, Finding of FAELS ORDER, de-NYING the claim as ENCEPTIONED & BOVE 25 WEll as hereby designeting the ENTIRE lecord, seeking that such is approved to the Legislature and Legislative coursel. Respectfully, 15/ Hayward Patherson dated: Haywood Patterson #145893 7/27/13 Geines UNIT 300 Coestofians DR 13